

# Spatial-Temporal Union of Subspaces for Multi-body NRSFM: Supplementary Material

Suryansh Kumar<sup>1</sup>, Yuchao Dai<sup>1</sup>, Hongdong Li<sup>1,2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Research School of Engineering, The Australian National University  
<sup>2</sup> Australian Centre for Robotic Vision.

{suryansh.kumar, yuchao.dai, hongdong.li}@anu.edu.au

**Abstract.** This paper provides a detailed derivation to the solutions and statistical data of the results provided in [2].

## 1 Detailed derivation of the solution

### 1.1 Solution for $\mathbf{S}$

$$\mathbf{S} = \underset{\mathbf{S}}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{W} - \mathbf{R}\mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_1, \mathbf{S}^{\sharp} - \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}) \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^{\sharp} - \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_2, \mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2.$$

We are minimizing this equation w.r.t  $\mathbf{S}$ . Therefore, we convert the second and third term in the above equation to the dimension of  $\mathbf{S}$ .

$$\mathbf{S}^{\sharp} = \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}) \Rightarrow \mathbf{S} = \mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}) \text{ (linear mapping).}$$

Similarly, Lagrange multiplier  $\mathbf{Y}_1$  is mapped to the dimension of  $\mathbf{S}$ .

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{S} &= \underset{\mathbf{S}}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{W} - \mathbf{R}\mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}) - \mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{Y}_1), \mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}) - \mathbf{S} \rangle \\ &< \mathbf{Y}_2, \mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \\ &= \underset{\mathbf{S}}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{W} - \mathbf{R}\mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} (\|\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \|\mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 - 2\operatorname{Tr}((\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}))^{\mathbf{T}}\mathbf{S}) + \\ &\operatorname{Tr}((\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{Y}_1))^{\mathbf{T}}(\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}))) - \operatorname{Tr}((\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{Y}_1))^{\mathbf{T}}\mathbf{S}) + \langle \mathbf{Y}_2, \mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \\ &= \underset{\mathbf{S}}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{W} - \mathbf{R}\mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} (\|\mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 - 2\operatorname{Tr}((\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}))^{\mathbf{T}}\mathbf{S}) - \frac{2}{\beta} \operatorname{Tr}((\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{Y}_1))^{\mathbf{T}}\mathbf{S})) + \\ &< \mathbf{Y}_2, \mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \left\{ \mathbf{S}^{\sharp}, \mathbf{Y}_1 \text{ are constants when minimizing over } \mathbf{S} \right\} \end{aligned} \tag{1}$$

Since, adding constants to the above form will not affect the solution of  $\mathbf{S}$ .

Therefore, we are adding  $\|\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}) + \frac{\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{Y}_1)}{\beta}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2$  inside the second term,

which will give us the form

$$\mathbf{S} = \underset{\mathbf{S}}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{1}{2} \|\mathbf{W} - \mathbf{R}\mathbf{S}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S} - (\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^{\sharp}) + \frac{\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{Y}_1)}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_2, \mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2.$$

The closed form solution for  $\mathbf{S}$  can be derived by taking derivative of (1) w.r.t to  $\mathbf{S}$  and equating to zero.

$$\frac{1}{\beta}(\mathbf{R}^T\mathbf{R} + \beta\mathbf{I})\mathbf{S} + \mathbf{S}(\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{C}_1)(\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{C}_1^T) = \frac{1}{\beta}\mathbf{R}^T\mathbf{W} + \left( \mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{S}^\sharp) + \frac{\mathbf{g}^{-1}(\mathbf{Y}_1)}{\beta} - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_2}{\beta}(\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{C}_1^T) \right). \quad (2)$$

## 1.2 Solution for $\mathbf{S}^\sharp$

$$\mathbf{S}^\sharp = \underset{\mathbf{S}^\sharp}{\operatorname{argmin}} \langle \mathbf{Y}_1, \mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}) \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_3, \mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2 \rangle +$$

$$\frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_8, \mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{J} \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{J}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2.$$

Here, also the first two term and last two terms is condensed to a simpler form for mathematical convenience without affecting the final solution.

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{S}^\sharp = \underset{\mathbf{S}^\sharp}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \operatorname{Tr}(\mathbf{Y}_1^T \mathbf{S}^\sharp) - \operatorname{Tr}(\mathbf{Y}_1^T \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S})) + \frac{\beta}{2} (\|\mathbf{S}^\sharp\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \|\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 - 2\operatorname{Tr}((\mathbf{S}^\sharp)^T \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}))) \\ & + \langle \mathbf{Y}_3, \mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \operatorname{Tr}(\mathbf{Y}_8^T \mathbf{S}^\sharp) - \operatorname{Tr}(\mathbf{Y}_8^T \mathbf{J}) + \frac{\beta}{2} (\|\mathbf{S}^\sharp\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \|\mathbf{J}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 \\ & - 2\operatorname{Tr}((\mathbf{S}^\sharp)^T \mathbf{J})). \end{aligned}$$

Since, we are minimizing over  $\mathbf{S}^\sharp$ . The terms which are not dependent on  $\mathbf{S}^\sharp$  can be considered as constants, which gives us:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{S}^\sharp = \underset{\mathbf{S}^\sharp}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \frac{\beta}{2} (\|\mathbf{S}^\sharp\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 - 2\operatorname{Tr}(\mathbf{S}^\sharp)^T (\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}) - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_1}{\beta})) + \langle \mathbf{Y}_3, \mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 \\ & + \frac{\beta}{2} (\|\mathbf{S}^\sharp\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 - 2\operatorname{Tr}(\mathbf{S}^\sharp)^T (\mathbf{J} - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_8}{\beta})). \end{aligned}$$

Adding  $\|\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}) - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_1}{\beta}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2$  and  $\|\mathbf{J} - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_8}{\beta}\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2$  inside the first term and last term respectively to get the quadratic form. As these terms are constants when minimizing over  $\mathbf{S}^\sharp$  it will not affect the final solution.

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{S}^\sharp = \underset{\mathbf{S}^\sharp}{\operatorname{argmin}} & \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - (\mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}) - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_1}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_3, \mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - \mathbf{S}^\sharp \mathbf{C}_2\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \\ & \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\sharp - (\mathbf{J} - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_8}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

The closed form solution for  $\mathbf{S}^\sharp$  can be derived by taking derivative of (3) w.r.t  $\mathbf{S}^\sharp$  and equating to zero.

$$\mathbf{S}^\sharp(2\mathbf{I} + (\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{C}_2)(\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{C}_2^T)) = \left( \mathbf{g}(\mathbf{S}) - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_1}{\beta} \right) + (\mathbf{J} - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_8}{\beta}) - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_3}{\beta}(\mathbf{I} - \mathbf{C}_2^T). \quad (4)$$

### 1.3 Solution for $\mathbf{C}_1$

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathbf{C}_1 &= \underset{\mathbf{C}_1}{\operatorname{argmin}} \langle \mathbf{Y}_2, \mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S} - \mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_4, \mathbf{1}^T \mathbf{C}_1 - \mathbf{1}^T \rangle + \\
&\frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{1}^T \mathbf{C}_1 - \mathbf{1}^T\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_6, \mathbf{C}_1 - \mathbf{E}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{C}_1 - \mathbf{E}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \quad (5) \\
&= \underset{\mathbf{C}_1}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}\mathbf{C}_1 - (\mathbf{S} + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_2}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{1}^T \mathbf{C}_1 - (\mathbf{1}^T - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_4}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{C}_1 - (\mathbf{E}_1 - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_6}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2.
\end{aligned}$$

The closed form solution for  $\mathbf{C}_1$  is solved as:

$$(\mathbf{S}^T \mathbf{S} + \mathbf{1}\mathbf{1}^T + \mathbf{I})\mathbf{C}_1 = \mathbf{S}^T (\mathbf{S} + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_2}{\beta}) + \mathbf{1}(\mathbf{1}^T - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_4}{\beta}) + (\mathbf{E}_1 - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_6}{\beta}). \quad (6)$$

$$\mathbf{C}_1 = \mathbf{C}_1 - \operatorname{diag}(\mathbf{C}_1), \quad (7)$$

### 1.4 Solution for $\mathbf{C}_2$

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathbf{C}_2 &= \underset{\mathbf{C}_2}{\operatorname{argmin}} \langle \mathbf{Y}_3, \mathbf{S}^\# - \mathbf{S}^\# \mathbf{C}_2 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\# - \mathbf{S}^\# \mathbf{C}_2\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_5, \mathbf{1}^T \mathbf{C}_2 - \mathbf{1}^T \rangle + \\
&+ \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{1}^T \mathbf{C}_2 - \mathbf{1}^T\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_7, \mathbf{C}_2 - \mathbf{E}_2 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{C}_2 - \mathbf{E}_2\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \quad (8) \\
&= \underset{\mathbf{C}_2}{\operatorname{argmin}} \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{S}^\# \mathbf{C}_2 - (\mathbf{S}^\# + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_3}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{1}^T \mathbf{C}_2 - (\mathbf{1}^T - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_5}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{C}_2 - (\mathbf{E}_2 - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_7}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2.
\end{aligned}$$

The closed form solution for  $\mathbf{C}_2$  is derived as:

$$\left( (\mathbf{S}^\#)^T \mathbf{S}^\# + \mathbf{1}\mathbf{1}^T + \mathbf{I} \right) \mathbf{C}_2 = (\mathbf{S}^\#)^T (\mathbf{S}^\# + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_3}{\beta}) + \mathbf{1}(\mathbf{1}^T - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_5}{\beta}) + (\mathbf{E}_2 - \frac{\mathbf{Y}_7}{\beta}). \quad (9)$$

$$\mathbf{C}_2 = \mathbf{C}_2 - \operatorname{diag}(\mathbf{C}_2), \quad (10)$$

### 1.5 Solution for $\mathbf{E}_1$

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathbf{E}_1 &= \underset{\mathbf{E}_1}{\operatorname{argmin}} \lambda_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_1 + \gamma_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_6, \mathbf{C}_1 - \mathbf{E}_1 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{C}_1 - \mathbf{E}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \\
&= \underset{\mathbf{E}_1}{\operatorname{argmin}} \lambda_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_1 + \gamma_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{E}_1 - (\mathbf{C}_1 + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_6}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2. \\
&= \underset{\mathbf{E}_1}{\operatorname{argmin}} \lambda_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_1 + \gamma_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 - \beta \langle \mathbf{E}_1, (\mathbf{C}_1 + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_6}{\beta}) \rangle \quad (11) \\
&= \underset{\mathbf{E}_1}{\operatorname{argmin}} \lambda_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_1 + (\gamma_1 + \frac{\beta}{2}) (\|\mathbf{E}_1\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2 + \frac{2\beta}{2\gamma_1 + \beta} \langle \mathbf{E}_1, \mathbf{C}_1 + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_6}{\beta} \rangle). \\
&= \underset{\mathbf{E}_1}{\operatorname{argmin}} \lambda_1 \|\mathbf{E}_1\|_1 + (\gamma_1 + \frac{\beta}{2}) \|\mathbf{E}_1 - \frac{\beta}{2\gamma_1 + \beta} (\mathbf{C}_1 + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_6}{\beta})\|_{\mathbb{F}}^2.
\end{aligned}$$

The closed form solution for  $\mathbf{E}_1$  is reached as:

$$\mathbf{E}_1 = \mathcal{S}_{\frac{\lambda_1}{\gamma_1 + \frac{\beta}{2}}} \left( \frac{\beta}{2\gamma_1 + \beta} (\mathbf{C}_1 + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_6}{\beta}) \right) \quad (12)$$

## 1.6 Solution for $\mathbf{E}_2$

The derivation for the solution of  $\mathbf{E}_2$  is similar to the solution of  $\mathbf{E}_1$ .

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{E}_2 &= \underset{\mathbf{E}_2}{\operatorname{argmin}} \lambda_3 \|\mathbf{E}_2\|_1 + \gamma_3 \|\mathbf{E}_2\|_F^2 + \langle \mathbf{Y}_7, \mathbf{C}_2 - \mathbf{E}_2 \rangle + \frac{\beta}{2} \|\mathbf{C}_2 - \mathbf{E}_2\|_F^2 \\ &= \underset{\mathbf{E}_2}{\operatorname{argmin}} \lambda_3 \|\mathbf{E}_2\|_1 + \left(\gamma_3 + \frac{\beta}{2}\right) \|\mathbf{E}_2\|_F^2 - \frac{\beta}{2\gamma_3 + \beta} \left(\mathbf{C}_2 + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_7}{\beta}\right) \|\mathbf{E}_2\|_F^2. \end{aligned} \quad (13)$$

The closed form solution for  $\mathbf{E}_2$  is reached as:

$$\mathbf{E}_2 = \mathcal{S}_{\frac{\lambda_3}{\gamma_3 + \frac{\beta}{2}}} \left( \frac{\beta}{2\gamma_3 + \beta} \left( \mathbf{C}_2 + \frac{\mathbf{Y}_7}{\beta} \right) \right). \quad (14)$$

## 2 Tables for each comparison

**Table 1.** Table corresponding to Figure 7

Datasets	BMM	PND	Zhu et al.	Kumar et al. [1]	Ours
Dance+Yoga	0.045	0.078	0.052	0.046	<b>0.043</b>
Drink+Walking	0.074	<b>0.060</b>	0.083	0.073	0.071
Shark+Stretch	0.024	<b>0.015</b>	0.067	0.025	0.019
Walking+Yoga	0.070	0.072	0.087	0.070	<b>0.066</b>
Face+Pickup	0.032	<b>0.012</b>	0.018	0.025	0.022
Face+Yoga	0.017	<b>0.010</b>	0.028	0.019	0.017
Shark+Yoga	0.035	<b>0.018</b>	0.094	0.037	0.033
Stretch+Yoga	0.039	0.109	0.045	0.039	<b>0.036</b>

**Table 2.** Table corresponding to Figure 8

Datasets	BMM	PND	Zhu et al.	Kumar et al. [1]	Ours
p2_free_2	0.1973	0.1544	<b>0.1142</b>	0.1992	0.1171
p2_grab_2	0.2018	0.1570	0.0960	0.2080	<b>0.0822</b>
p3_ball_1	0.1356	0.1477	0.0832	0.1348	<b>0.0810</b>
p4_meet_12	0.0802	0.0862	0.0972	0.0821	<b>0.0815</b>
p4_table_12	0.2313	0.1588	0.1322	0.2313	<b>0.0994</b>

**Table 3.** Table corresponding to Figure 11

Datasets	BMM	PND	Zhu et al.	Kumar et al. [1]	Ours
Face Sequence 1	0.078	0.077	0.082	0.075	<b>0.073</b>
Face Sequence 2	0.059	0.062	0.063	<b>0.050</b>	0.052
Face Sequence 3	0.042	0.051	0.057	<b>0.038</b>	0.039
Face Sequence 4	0.049	0.041	0.056	0.044	<b>0.040</b>

## References

1. Kumar, S., Dai, Y., Li, H.: Multi-body non-rigid structure-from-motion. arXiv preprint arXiv:1607.04515 (2016)
2. Kumar, S., Dai, Y., Li, H.: Spatial-temporal union of subspaces for multi-body non-rigid structure-from-motion. arXiv preprint arXiv:1705.04916 (2017)